

Economics: Mixed Record

Alessandro Lizzeri

May 1 2013

Theme

- ▶ Economics as a way of thinking about policy. Few numbers solid enough to make precise confident recommendations.

Theme

- ▶ Economics as a way of thinking about policy. Few numbers solid enough to make precise confident recommendations.
- ▶ Not much replication.

Theme

- ▶ Economics as a way of thinking about policy. Few numbers solid enough to make precise confident recommendations.
- ▶ Not much replication.
- ▶ One-handed economists in the media vs two-handed economists in academia.

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!
Response: use variation in government policies (Iceland in 1987).

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!
Response: use variation in government policies (Iceland in 1987).
Wide heterogeneity in estimates. Ranging from zero to 1 (large incomes). Macro estimates larger than micro estimates.
Long run vs. short run.

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!
Response: use variation in government policies (Iceland in 1987).
Wide heterogeneity in estimates. Ranging from zero to 1 (large incomes). Macro estimates larger than micro estimates.
Long run vs. short run.
Wildly different implications for policy.

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!
Response: use variation in government policies (Iceland in 1987).
Wide heterogeneity in estimates. Ranging from zero to 1 (large incomes). Macro estimates larger than micro estimates.
Long run vs. short run.
Wildly different implications for policy.
Similar range for estimates of risk aversion or discount factors.

Challenges for Empirical Research in Economics

- ▶ Example(s) 1: Stimulus, Reinhart-Rogoff (2010) on relation between government debt and growth.
- ▶ Example 2: estimating elasticity of labor supply. Variation in wages typically far from random!
Response: use variation in government policies (Iceland in 1987).
Wide heterogeneity in estimates. Ranging from zero to 1 (large incomes). Macro estimates larger than micro estimates.
Long run vs. short run.
Wildly different implications for policy.
Similar range for estimates of risk aversion or discount factors.

More Challenges

More Challenges

- ▶ Example 3. Importance of institutions for development. Extractive institutions bad for development? Instrument in Acemoglu et al. (2001): settler mortality. “Replicated” by Albouy (2008) (part of David Card’s famous sequence): modified mortality figures lead to much weaker results.

More Challenges

- ▶ Example 3. Importance of institutions for development. Extractive institutions bad for development? Instrument in Acemoglu et al. (2001): settler mortality. “Replicated” by Albouy (2008) (part of David Card’s famous sequence): modified mortality figures lead to much weaker results.
- ▶ Example 4. Effect of school competition on student outcomes (Hoxby 2000). Number of school districts is endogenous. Rivers as instruments. Large positive effects of competition. Rothstein (another Card student) (2007): effect not robust, depends on definition of river.

More Challenges

- ▶ Example 3. Importance of institutions for development. Extractive institutions bad for development? Instrument in Acemoglu et al. (2001): settler mortality. “Replicated” by Albouy (2008) (part of David Card’s famous sequence): modified mortality figures lead to much weaker results.
- ▶ Example 4. Effect of school competition on student outcomes (Hoxby 2000). Number of school districts is endogenous. Rivers as instruments. Large positive effects of competition. Rothstein (another Card student) (2007): effect not robust, depends on definition of river.

Bigger Picture

Bigger Picture

- ▶ Versbach-Mueller Langer (2013) “We provide evidence for the status quo in economics with respect to data sharing using a unique data set with 488 hand-collected observations randomly taken from researchers’ academic webpages. Out of the sample, 435 researchers (89.14%) neither have a data&code section nor indicate whether and where their data is available. We find that 8.81% of researchers share some of their data whereas only 2.05% fully share.”

Bigger Picture

- ▶ Versbach-Mueller Langer (2013) “We provide evidence for the status quo in economics with respect to data sharing using a unique data set with 488 hand-collected observations randomly taken from researchers’ academic webpages. Out of the sample, 435 researchers (89.14%) neither have a data&code section nor indicate whether and where their data is available. We find that 8.81% of researchers share some of their data whereas only 2.05% fully share.”
- ▶ Hammermesh (2006). In economics, pure replication is rare. Scientific replication not as common as it should be.

The Bright Side

The Bright Side

- ▶ Since 5-6 years ago, major journals now require posting data and code (except for proprietary data).

The Bright Side

- ▶ Since 5-6 years ago, major journals now require posting data and code (except for proprietary data).
- ▶ Some work on publicly available data sets widely and successfully replicated. Questions of importance to policy examined from many different angles. A lot of successful (narrow) replication and some attempts to make sense of ranges of estimates in other contexts (Chetty 2012, Frechette Yuksel 2013).